

MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
17 January, 1973

AM

10:00 CONVENE, 708 Jackson Place, N.W., Washington, D.C.

ADMINISTRATION

1. Dates of Next Meetings: 21 February, 1973
21 March, 1973
2. Approval of Minutes of December, 1972 Meeting.
3. Illumination of Jefferson and Lincoln Memorials and other Federal Buildings - Status.
4. Georgetown Planning Group: Phase I Report: Development Concept Alternatives.

SUBMISSIONS-REVIEWS

1. D.C. Government, Department of Economic Development
Old Georgetown Act
 - a. O.G. 73-79, 3050 K Street, N.W. - Inland Steel, Proposed Office and Commercial Complex.
 - b. Appendix 1.Shipstead-Luce Act
 - a. S.L. 73-33, 2130 P Street, N.W. - Proposed Apartment Building and Commercial Space, Preliminary Design.
 - b. Appendix 2.
2. D.C. Government, Department of General Services
Office of the D.C. Medical Examiner (Morgue) - Revised Preliminary Designs.
3. Department of the Army, Corps of Engineers
Enlisted Men's Barracks and Open Mess, Walter Reed Army Medical Center - Revised Design.
4. Department of the Navy, Naval Facilities Engineering Command
Anacostia-Bolling Air Force Base Chapel Center - Revised Designs.

5. National Park Service

Frederick Douglass Home Visitor Center - Preliminary Design.

6. D.C. Council of Governments

Bus Shelter - Prototype Design.

7. D.C. Zoning Commission

Revised Sign Regulations, Preliminary Report.

8. American Battle Monuments Commission

2nd Division Infantry Memorial - St. Vith, Belgium.

9. The Freer Gallery

Inspection of Acquisitions.

INTERVIEWS

11:30 D.C. Government, Department of Economic Development

A. O.G. 73-79 - Inland Steel Project.

B. S.L. 73-33 - Apartment Building and Commercial Space.

12:00 D.C. Government, Department of General Services

Office of the D.C. Medical Examiner (Morgue).

12:15 Department of the Army, Corps of Engineers

Enlisted Men's Barracks and Open Mess - Walter Reed Army Medical Center.

12:30 Department of the Navy, Naval Facilities Engineering Command

Anacostia-Bolling Air Force Base Chapel Center.

12:45 National Park Service

Frederick Douglass Home Visitor Center.

1:00 D.C. Council of Governments

Bus Shelters.

1:15 Freer Gallery Inspection of Acquisitions.

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
17 January, 1973

Meeting convened at 9:00 a.m. at the Commission of Fine Arts
offices at 708 Jackson Place, N.W., Washington, D.C.

Members Present: Hon. J. Carter Brown, Chairman
 Hon. Nicolas Arroyo
 Hon. Jane O. Dart
 Hon. Kevin Roche
 Hon. Chloethiel Woodard Smith
 Hon. Edward D. Stone, Jr.

Staff Present: Mr. Charles H. Atherton, Secretary
 Mr. Donald B. Myer, Assistant Secretary
 Mr. J.L. Sibley Jennings, Jr.
 Mrs. Nancy Lusher
 Miss Lynda Smith

National Capital Planning
Commission Staff Present: Mr. Charles Conrad, Executive Director
 Mr. David McKinnon
 Mr. Martin Rody

I. ADMINISTRATION

A. Dates of the following two meetings were set for February
21st and March 21st, 1973.

B. Minutes from the December 1st, 1972, meeting were approved.

C. Illumination of the Jefferson and Lincoln Memorials and other
Federal Buildings was discussed by the Secretary. He reported that
he and the Assistant Secretary had met with Mr. R. Dickenson of the
National Park Service and had been assured of continuing cooperation
on all fronts, but that temporary measures were being investigated
for the Jefferson Memorial while financial and contractual difficulties
were being met. The Secretary also reported inconclusive talks with
the General Services Administration and recommended further attempts
after the pending Executive reorganization. The Chairman also reported
discussion of the illumination problem with Park Service staff members,
stating that he had been told the Secretary of Interior was taking a
personal interest in the Jefferson Memorial problem.

D. Georgetown Waterfront planning report. The Assistant Secretary briefly described the main features of the Georgetown Planning Group, Phase I Report. These included six highway alternatives run through three permutations of low, moderate, and high density development. The report included recommendations for elimination of the present 90 foot industrial zoning and inclusion of maximum 60 foot and some 40 foot heights as well as the addition of residential zoning. A 50 foot minimum setback for a continuous public waterfront park and a tunneled freeway with a surface K Street connecting to Canal Road were features of the plan. Preservation of historic and geographic features were a part of the plan in the interest of preserving, promoting, and developing this valuable historic district and highly visible part of the Nation's Capital. The Secretary went on to say that the Staff had carefully examined the report and inspected the Waterfront on foot several times in a detailed investigation of the proposals and existing features. They found its basic principles desirable. Some of the features were applicable to the Commission's current project review even though the plan had no official Planning or Zoning Commission status. The Secretary, in particular, mentioned the 60 foot height limit and 50 foot setback from the water as being applicable to the Commission's authority and present review of the Inland Steel Project.

The Secretary pointed out several weaknesses in the report. One was the inclusion of present Zoning requirements to provide parking in all new buildings, which could only cause hopeless congestion on the waterfront - he recommended an alternate of requiring parking only on the periphery of the area. The other lack was in assessing needs or systems of public transportation on the waterfront. The Staff felt that the exclusion of Mass transportation while digging up the entire waterfront for an automobile tunnel would be a grave error.

Mr. Charles Conrad, Executive Director of the National Capital Planning Commission, was introduced next. Mr. Conrad briefly told the Commission of the progress of the contract on the Georgetown Waterfront and of the Planning Commission's hope that obsolete waterfront zoning could be revised and the Planning Commission's Sectional Development Plan for the Capital could be updated on the authority of the present study. The Chairman told Mr. Conrad of the Fine Arts Commission's questions on mass transit and parking requirements. Mr. Conrad responded that these as well as several other questions were to be put to the consultant prior to the next phase of the contract. Mr. Roche asked Mr. Conrad how far from the edge of the water development ought it be kept and Mr. Conrad allowed that the 50 feet recommended in the Consultant's study was in line with the non-specific guidelines currently under study by the Planning Commission in its investigations of the waterfronts throughout Washington. Mr. Conrad also agreed that the 90 foot height limits and industrial zoning were obsolete. The Chairman thanked Mr. Conrad for meeting with the Commission and Mr. Conrad and Mr. Rody left.

II. SUBMISSIONS AND REVIEWS

A. D.C. Government, Department of Economic Development

Old Georgetown Act

1. O.G. 73-79, 3050 K Street, N.W. - Inland Steel, Proposed Office and Commercial Complex. The Secretary showed the Commission a model and several drawings on this resubmission stating that there were subtle changes to the East and West sides of the structure, but the concept, most features and the bulk of the proposal had not been altered since the last meeting. The Chairman suggested that the Commission consider applying the 50-foot set back and 60-foot height limit to this project, based on the report, precedent and the Commission's authority. The Commission was in agreement with this, but Mr. Roche suggested that the 50-foot set back be further defined. This was agreed to mean not just a set back, but a green urban continuation of the waterfront parks along the Potomac, and a non-commercial space. Further action was withheld until a meeting with the project representatives and the Georgetown Citizens Association later in the day.

Exhibit A.

2. Appendix 1, approved.

Shipstead-Luce Act

1. S.L. 73-33, 2130 P Street, N.W. - Proposed Apartment Building and Commercial Space, Preliminary Design. The Commission approved the design for this multi-story masonry apartment building with shops on the ground floor and balconies on most bays above, with the provision that efforts be made to diminish the height of the penthouse.

Exhibit B.

2. Appendix 2, approved.

B. D.C. Government, Department of General Services

Office of the D.C. Medical Examiner. The Secretary presented drawings for revised designs of the D.C. Medical Examiner's Office (Morgue), D.C. General Hospital Grounds. The design which had been disapproved at the December 1st, 1972, meeting pending a master plan and landscape coordination with the nearby proposed Jail and restudy of the exterior appearance of the structure. The architect had submitted two additional facade studies for the building and a landscape plan by the same architect commissioned for the Jail, Lester Collins. The Commission discussed the alternate facade schemes and decided that further study would not be necessary, but to withhold further comment until a conference with the Medical Examiner and the Architect later in the day.

C. Department of the Army, Corps of Engineers

The revised design for the Enlisted Men's Barracks and Open Mess, Walter Reed Army Medical Center, were presented by the Assistant Secretary. He reminded the Commission that their December action had recommended restudy of the spandrel panels, which had not been done. The Service Drive had been changed and screened from view and the former triangular shaped Service Club had been made rectangular. The design had also eliminated the standing seam metal gable roofs in favor of flat roofs. The Commission generally endorsed these changes, feeling that the spandrels could still be modified, but they questioned the treatment of the downhill end of the building which appeared to hover over inadequate, spindley columns. The members withheld further comment until a meeting with project representatives later in the day.

D. Department of the Navy, Naval Facilities Engineering Command

The Assistant Secretary presented revised designs for the Anacostia-Bolling Air Force Base Chapel Center. With a model and drawings he showed the architect's response to a request for restudy of the building's massing. Several of the roofs were changed, a cut-out in the side of the sanctuary was eliminated and the main roof was refined to distinguish the Chapel from the auxillary functions. The Commission felt that a solution separating the spiritual from the functional elements, perhaps, with the use of a cloister, might help. The Commission agreed the design was not good enough yet to be acceptable and felt that either a design consultant should be brought into the project or military regulations forcing the design be examined. Discussion was withheld until a conference later with the project representatives.

E. National Park Service

Frederick Douglass House Visitor Center, 14th & W Streets, S.E. - preliminary design. The Secretary showed the Commission a model and drawings for Phase One. A Phase Two on the drawings was not being presented to the Commission by the Park Service and not recommended for comment by the Staff. The proposal included an underground facility with a small auditorium, rest rooms and office space with through-the-roof stairs leading up the hill above to the house. A small parking lot and bus spaces were included as well. The Commission felt that the proposal did little violence to the house on its hilltop and was on the least visible part of the site. The consensus of the Commission was that it would be desirable to diminish the impact of the underground center visually from the street - in general use less surface masonry. The Commission withheld further discussion until a meeting later in the day with the project representatives.

F. D.C. Council of Governments

The Secretary showed the Commission drawings and a model for a proposed bus shelter to be used experimentally in five downtown locations. The Members felt that the cantilever, one-post, bubble-top design was a bit contrived and that a simpler solution with the roof supported on light wind screens would be better. Mr. Roche suggested that the Commission recommend redesign. The Chairman withheld further discussion until a conference with the project representatives.

G. D.C. Zoning Commission

The Secretary outlined provisions in a report by the Zoning Commission suggesting revised sign regulations. He pointed out that part of the recommendations included forming a review body to consider most sign application exceptions on their own merits and that the proposal would not affect current Fine Arts jurisdiction. The Commission concurred that Washington sign regulations could stand some improvement but were still far superior to those in other places. The Chairman suggested that the Commission offer its services to the Zoning Commission in this matter, rather than being negative on the report - to suggest review of the final draft or actual proposed regulations by this Commission.

Exhibit C.

H. American Battle Monuments Commission

The Secretary presented drawings for the 2nd Division Infantry Memorial, proposed for St. Vith, Belgium. A seven-foot high, black granite memorial with a large overlapping unit insignia has been proposed by the Battle Monuments Commission and approved by local authorities in Belgium. The Commission of Fine Arts felt that the design was a bit complicated and that it should recommend a smaller scale simple rectangular monolith with an inscribed design. A letter to that effect should be sent to the Battle Monuments Commission.

Exhibit D.

I. The Freer Gallery

The Secretary told the Commission of the provisions in Mr. Freer's will requiring that all new acquisitions of the Freer Gallery be approved by the Commission of Fine Arts. He stated that the Gallery had several items for the Commission's inspection and that an appointment had been made for 1:30 p.m. after the present business. The Commission agreed.

III. INTERVIEWS

A. D.C. Government, Department of Economic Development

1. O.G. 73-79, 3050 K Street, N.W. - Inland Steel Project, 12:20.

The project was represented by Arthur Moore, the Architect, and Robert Larson of Inland Steel. The Georgetown Citizens' Association was represented by Capt. Peter Belin, the President, and Col. Robert Evans. The Commission of Fine Arts Old Georgetown Board was represented by Thomas Stohlman and Wynant Vanderpool. The Chairman welcomed Mr. Moore as spokesman of the project and reported the Commission's findings. The Chairman's statement (transcript attached), included the requirements that the project be restudied to provide a minimum 50-foot setback from the river with a continuous green non-commercial waterfront promenade and that the height of the building be generally limited to 60 feet. After a brief discussion of these points, the Chairman thanked Mr. Moore.

B. D.C. Government, Department of General Services

Office of the D.C. Medical Examiner (Morgue). 12:40. The Medical Examiner, Dr. Luke, was present as was the Architect, Moffatt D. Adams. The District Government was represented by M.R. Pavlick. The Landscape Architect Lester Collins was also present. The Chairman gave the floor to Dr. Luke who explained the basic philosophy of the building's operation as a scientific laboratory and its general appearance. The Chairman then told the Architect that the Commission appreciated his effort in coordination with the Jail by hiring Mr. Collins and restudying the facade. The Commission's action was, however, to disapprove the project once again, stating that the entrance motif, relation to the ground and siting were still unsolved. Mr. Collins briefly described his efforts at coordinating the Morgue and Jail landscaping and regretted that no Master Plan was possible at this time. The Chairman indicated the continuing need for coordination of these projects in this very important and visible part of the city. Exhibit E.

C. Department of the Army, Corps of Engineers

Enlisted Men's Barracks and Open Mess - Walter Reed Army Medical Center, 12:50. The Army was represented by Mr. T.J. Mahan of the Baltimore District Corps of Engineers. The Architectural firm of L B C & W was represented by Homer Blackwell. The Chairman indicated the Commission's general approval of the changes since the December meeting, but requested reconsideration of the color change on the spandrels and further work on the downhill end of the building to fill in around the exposed columns. Mr. Blackwell agreed to study that possibility. Exhibit F.

D. Department of the Navy, Naval Facilities Engineering Command

Anacostia-Bolling Air Force Base Chapel Center, 1:05. The Navy was represented by Cdr. Boothe and Mr. Lose. The Architect, Mr. Leroy Campbell of Sulton and Campbell was also present. The Chairman informed Commander Boothe of the Commission's continued disapproval of the design, suggesting that the design had still not jelled geomet-

rically and that perhaps a design consultant should be retained to assist in further study efforts. Cdr. Boothe thanked the Commission. Exhibit G.

E. National Park Service

Frederick Douglass House Visitor Center, 1:15. The Park Service was represented by Robert Romanowski and the Architects present were Robert Nash and Steve Cram of R.J. Nash Associates. The Chairman thanked Mr. Nash for appearing and told of the Commission's general endorsement of Phase One and the efforts to use a non-architectural solution to the problem. The Commission's desire for less masonry at the entrance to the visitor center was transmitted to the Park Service. Exhibit H.

F. D.C. Council of Governments

Bus Shelters, 1:20. The project was represented by Sprague Thresher, Director of Architecture of WMATA and the designer Jerry Karn of Harry Weese and Associates. The Chairman informed Mr. Karn of the Commission's disapproval of the single-legged, cantilever design and suggested that a simpler solution supporting the roof on light wind screens be studied. Mr. Karn said that such a scheme had been considered, but offered difficulties with respect to right-of-way, etc., but that it would be possible to look at the question again. Exhibit I.

The Chairman adjourned the meeting at 1:30 and the Commission went to the Freer Gallery, where they approved all the purchases shown them by Drs. Stern and Lawton, as listed in the attached.



Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

<u>NO.</u>	<u>ADDRESS AND OWNER</u>	<u>PROJECT</u>
OG 73-		
67	1251 Wisconsin Avenue, N.W. Margann F. Dodge	One 2'x 3' Alum. sign with scroll bracket and two lighting fixtures.
ACTION:	Issue permit. Consider location of bracket lower - at belt course.	12-13-72
68	2813 M Street, N.W. 2813 M Street Associates	Renovation for gallery and apartments.
ACTION:	Do not issue permit. Recommend retention of existing cornice. Restudy upper windows. Solid sheets of glass not recommended. Round windows not recommended. Suggest restudy, perhaps with a single sheet of plate glass.	12-13-72
69	3319 N Street, N.W. Glen Hickerson	Erection of one-car garage.
ACTION:	Issue permit.	12-13-72
70	1513 27th Street, N.W. Dr. C. Herbert Marshall	Repairs to dwelling.
ACTION:	Issue permit.	12-13-72
71	2833 M Street, N.W. Serafim Altaris	Convert existing gas station into coffee shop repaving existing service area and enclosing said area to a patio-outdoor dining area.
ACTION:	Hold for site inspection. 12-13-72. Do not issue permit. Recommend large sheets of glass for windows and a trellis in lieu of awning along east property line. Request good elevation drawing.	1-10-73
72	3618 Prospect Street, N.W. H.S. Bogan, Jr.	Move existing garage door 8" forward from present location.
ACTION:	Issue permit.	12-15-72
73	2813 M Street, N.W. 2813 M Street Associates	Renovation and repairs.
ACTION:	Do not issue permit. Request clarification of details (rounds?), section and good elevation.	1-10-73
74	3116 M Street, N.W. American Indian Creative Arts, Inc.	Erection of new sign.
ACTION:	Do not issue permit. Out of character.	1-10-73

<u>NO.</u>	<u>ADDRESS AND OWNER</u>	<u>PROJECT</u>
75	3340 N Street, N.W. Dr. Eugene Frank	Add covered stoop on N Street front in public space.
ACTION:	Issue permit. 1-10-73	
76	1214 Wisconsin Avenue, N.W. William Horn	Erect sign.
ACTION:	Issue permit. 1-10-73	
77	1214 Wisconsin Avenue, N.W. William Horn	Erect awning.
ACTION:	Issue permit. 1-10-73	
78	1214 Wisconsin Avenue, N.W. William Horn	Storefront remodeling and alteration.
ACTION:	Issue permit. 1-10-73	

<u>NO.</u>	<u>ADDRESS AND OWNER</u>	<u>PROJECT</u>
SL 73-29	2012 Pierce Mill Road, N.W. Beulah Sauer	Replace front porch.
ACTION:	Issue permit. 12-6-72	
30	2700-2715 Unicorn Lane, N.W. Bonnie Brae Estates	Erection of masonry/wrought iron gate
ACTION:	Issue permit. 12-12-72	
31	801 17th Street, N.W. Colonial Parking	Erect two signs: one double-face, one single-face.
ACTION:	Do not issue permit. Request elimination of double-face sign on corner. No objection to single-face sign over garage entrance.	
32	801 17th Street, N.W. Colonial Parking	Single-face sign, as per S.L. 73-31, and action previously taken.
ACTION:	Issue permit for one single-faced sign set within soffit of garage entrance as per drawings. Double-faced vertical sign on facade disapproved. 1-10-73.	

14 February, 1973

Mr. Arthur B. Hatton
Executive Director
D.C. Zoning Commission
Room 604, District Building
14th & E Streets, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20004

Dear Mr. Hatton,

The Commission of Fine Arts appreciated the opportunity to review the Zoning Commission's preliminary report on proposed sign regulation changes. Though we have some reservations about the discretionary powers proposed in the report, we wholly support and offer our cooperation in further study of the subject.

Since Washington has had some of the more successful sign regulations in the country for some time, it is quite fitting that the City should continue its leadership in this field. We would hold that enforcement is a particularly difficult problem at the present, and that any efforts to improve it would be a substantial contribution in itself.

Sincerely yours,

J. Carter Brown
Chairman

14 February, 1973

Maj. Gen. A.V. Adams, Secretary
American Battle Monuments Commission
Room 2067, Tempo A Building
Washington, D.C. 20315

Dear Gen. Adams,

At its January 17th meeting, the Commission of Fine Arts disapproved the design for a 2nd Division Infantry Memorial for St. Vith, Belgium. We recommend restudy of a simple rectangular slab or stele, with the unit insignia incised or inlaid in monochromé.

If we can be of further service, our next meetings will be on the 21st of February and the 21st of March, 1973.

Sincerely yours,

J. Carter Brown
Chairman

14 February, 1973

Lt. Col. Sam D. Starobin, Director
D.C. Government Department of General Services
613 G Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20001

Dear Col. Starobin,

The Commission of Fine Arts once again disapproved plans for the proposed office of the D.C. Medical Examiner on the D.C. General Hospital grounds. Though the Commission welcomes the efforts by the District Government to tie in landscaping of this project with that of the new jail, we find the mere plopping down of a few trees on what is already a bad site plan a sad substitute for a much needed Master Plan.

Specifically, the Commission disapproved the two alternative exterior treatments recommended by the Architect. As a piece of architecture, the building's relation to the site and the ground plane are awkward, and the proposed entrance features need much more study. We hope that further design effort will result in a building of propriety and dignity.

The Commission's next meeting will be on February 21st, 1973. We will be glad to give further review at that time.

Sincerely yours,

J. Carter Brown
Chairman

14 February, 1973

Mr. T.J. Mahan
Baltimore District
U.S. Army Corps of Engineers
Post Office Box 1715
Baltimore, Maryland 21203

Dear Mr. Mahan,

The Commission of Fine Arts reviewed revised designs for the Enlisted Barracks and Open Mess for Walter Reed Army Medical Center at its January 17th meeting. We commend you on the extent and success of many of the changes since our December 1st meeting.

The Commission was particularly pleased by the new shape of the Service Club, and the screening of the Service Drive. We recommend that the spandrels be detailed either in brick to match the exterior or of some material with very little color contrast.

Our primary concern is still the downhill side of the building and we recommend further study of that facade. The proportion of the long columns and voids and their relation to the rooms above just does not work yet; perhaps the same solution of single-loaded corridors used on the garden facade would be best.

The Commission's next meeting will be on February 21st, 1973. We would be glad to review any further studies at that time.

Sincerely yours,

J. Carter Brown
Chairman

Exhibit F.

14 February, 1973

Cdr. A.P. Boothe
Department of the Navy
Chesapeake Division
Naval Facilities Engineering Command
Building 57, Washington Navy Yard
Washington, D.C. 20390

Dear Cdr. Boothe,

At its January 17th meeting the Commission of Fine Arts once again disapproved the Bolling-Anacostia Chapel design.

We feel that total redesign is the only answer. Even though the roof restudy did improve the building's geometry, it did not solve the problem of identity and some sense of dignity befitting the program. There is, after all, an impressive tradition of religious building design incorporating complicated functions and demanding programs, and this applies to small buildings of a relatively modest budget as well as larger structures.

One approach administratively to this matter might be retaining a design consultant to advise the Navy on the project.

Our next meeting will be on the 21st of February, 1973 - we will be glad to assist you in any way at that time.

Sincerely yours,

J. Carter Brown
Chairman

Exhibit G.

14 February, 1973

Mr. Russell Dickenson, Director
National Park Service
National Capital Region
1100 Ohio Drive, S.W.
Washington, D.C.

Dear Mr. Dickenson,

The Commission of Fine Arts approved the concept of Phase One of the Visitor Center design for the Frederick Douglass House at 14th and W Streets, S.E. We suggest restudy, however, of the entrance feature to minimize the amount of exposed concrete as much as possible. Some simplification and diminution of the roof and skylight areas would be equally desirable.

In your letter of submittal you asked for our comments on the Architect's proposal for Phase Two. Without getting into the specific merits of the scheme, we would simply advise against it as an aesthetic overloading of the site.

The Commission's next meetings will be on February 21st and March 21st. We will be happy to consider further study of the above features, then.

Sincerely yours,

J. Garner Brown
Chairman

14 February, 1973

Mr. Walter A. Scheiber, Director
Metropolitan Washington Council of Governments
1225 Connecticut Avenue, N.W., Room 201
Washington, D.C. 20036

Dear Mr. Scheiber,

At its meeting on January 17th, 1973, the Commission of Fine Arts recommended restudy of the proposed bus shelter design. We specifically object to the single column cantilever aspect of the shelter - this seems to us a contrivance, particularly in conjunction with the wind screens.

Restudy of the shelter, supporting it with wind screens or lighter posts will probably result in a unique design distinctively appropriate to the Nation's Capital. To do less for a regional prototype would be inconsistent with the high level of design excellence achieved in other elements of the Metro system.

The Commission's next meeting will be on February 21st, 1973. If we or the Staff can be of any help on or before that date, please let us know.

Sincerely yours,

J. Carter Brown
Chairman

Copy to: Sprague Thresher
Architectural Director, WMATA

